

THE IMPLEMENTATION OF COMPETENCY DEVELOPMENT OF STATE CIVIL APPARATUS IN THE FRAMEWORK OF FULFILLING THE RIGHTS OF CIVIL SERVANTS IN WEST SUMATRA PROVINCE

Khairani¹, Sri Arnetti², Fikri Hasan³

¹Universitas Andalas, Indonesia, khairani@law.unand.ac.id

²Universitas Andalas, Indonesia, azizhadi111@gmail.com

³Universitas Andalas, Indonesia, fikrihasan38@gmail.com

Received: 2023-04-09; Reviewed: 2023-04-24; Accepted: 2023-04-27; Published: 2023-04-27

Abstract

This study aims to know the implementation of competency development for Civil Servants (PNS) in West Sumatra. As an element of the state apparatus, civil servants have the right to participate in the development so that their competence in providing public services can possibly be carried out in a professional and qualified manner. The results of this study are expected to contribute to local government policies in managing the ASN. Based on Article 70 of Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus (UU ASN) which states that every ASN employee has the right and opportunity to develop their competency, each Government Agency is required to prepare an annual competency development plan that is included in the annual work plan of the respective agency's budget. This can have an impact on the competence of less effective personnel, causing their responsibilities to be carried out inefficiently and negatively impacting the quality of public services. The issues in this study: 1. How is the management of civil servants in West Sumatra Province? 2. How is the competency development of civil servants in West Sumatra Province implemented? The research method used is a sociological juridical (empirical) approach. This research is descriptive and analytical. The data are collected through interviews and document studies. This research aligns with the strategic research plan set by Andalas University for 2020 – 2024, which is focused on the issue of political and social law. The results of the study show that the management of PNS in West Sumatra Province has not been based on a comparison of the competencies and qualifications required by positions with the competencies and qualifications held by the PNS, owing to the merit system's ineffective implementation in PNS management. Implementation of PNS Competency Development in West Sumatra Province, from the data obtained, only 1,168 out of 18,614 civil servants in West Sumatra Province participated in PNS competency development, and the annual competency development plan document was not prepared, this shows that it is still not optimal and the implementation is not yet appropriate between civil servant competency development and applicable regulations,

Keywords: Competency Development; Civil Servants; Rights of Civil Servants

1. INTRODUCTION

The State of Indonesia is a state based on law, under the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. The concept of a state based on the law has brought Indonesia to become a modern legal state which is developing rapidly now. The national goals to be achieved by the Indonesian people are listed in the Preamble

to the 1945 Constitution paragraph IV, namely to form an Indonesian State Government that protects the entire Indonesian nation and all of Indonesia's bloodshed, promotes public welfare, educates the life of the nation, participates in carrying out world order based on independence, lasting peace, and social justice. The affirmation in the preamble of the 1945 Constitution is part of an effort to achieve the national goals, both in the form of human resources and material facilities, because the state cannot do it alone.¹ The implementation of the country's goals is carried out through a gradual, sustainable development process so that it has consequences for the government's role in providing the services to the community in a professional, honest, fair, and equitable manner in carrying out state, government, and development tasks.²

In the context of implementing the ideals of the nation's ideal and realizing the state's goals, as stated in the preamble to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, it is necessary to develop a state apparatus that has integrity, professional, neutral and free of political intervention, corruption, collusion, and nepotism, as well as being able to provide public services for the community and playing a role as an adhesive element to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. Civil employees in the bureaucracy are expected to work effectively in public sector management as one type of public organization with the legitimacy to execute diverse public affairs. However, this is not a simple task. Criticism of red tape bureaucracy such as poor quality of services, slowness of procedures, inefficiency, program implementation's failure, and so forth mostly addressed to the civil servants' poor performance. This red tape bureaucracy problem is in stark contrast to what the public bureaucracy should be doing and accomplishing.³

Based on Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus (UU ASN) in Article 1 Number 1, State Civil Apparatus is a profession for civil servants and government employees with work agreements who work in government agencies. Furthermore, in Article 1 Point 2 of the ASN Law, it reads:

"State Civil Apparatus Employees, hereinafter referred to as ASN Employees, are civil servants and government employees with work agreements who are appointed by a civil service development official and are entrusted with tasks in a government position or entrusted with other state duties and are paid a salary based on statutory regulations."

Furthermore, Article 1 Point 3 of the ASN Law explains that Civil Servants abbreviated as PNS, are Indonesian citizens who satisfy specified standards and are appointed ASN employees permanently to hold government jobs by staffing supervisors. Civil servants are employees of government agencies and are elements of the state apparatus to run the government and the development to achieve state goals. Civil servants as elements of the state apparatus, state servants and public servants in providing professional and quality public services to the community are required to have the competency, each

1 Sri Hartini, *Civil Service Law in Indonesia* (Jakarta: Sinar Graphic, 2011).

2 Sri Hartini.

3 Dyah Mutiarin, 'Improving Indonesia Civil Servants Performance', *Jurnal Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta*, 3.2 (2012), 1-21.

civil servant has a position and competence, and competency development possessed by civil servants is an effort to fulfill the competency needs based on standard position competencies and career development plans, career development as stated under Article 69 Paragraph (1) of the ASN Law that civil servant career development is carried out based on qualifications, competence, work assessment, and the needs of government agencies.

In Article 70 of the ASN Law. It is explained that:

“Every ASN employee has the right and opportunity to develop competence, including through education, training, courses, seminars, and upgrading programs. And in developing competence, each government agency is required to prepare an annual competency development plan which is contained in the annual work plan of the respective agency’s budget”.

Since the enactment of the ASN Law, there have been several objectives to be achieved, including improvements in ASN management and the implementation of competency development. One of the provisions regulated in this law is the stipulation of a merit system. In the implementation of ASN management where one of the dimensions is competency development, it must be based on a merit system approach.

Based on Article 1 Number 22 of the ASN Law, it is explained that the merit system is ASN policy and management based on qualifications, competence, and performance fairly and reasonably regardless of political background, race, skin color, religion, origin, gender, marital status, age, or disability. Legally this merit system is regulated and mandated through the ASN Law, but no further elaboration is found in several articles related to the explanation of the implementation of the merit system. Furthermore, the explanation and principles for implementing the merit system are explained in Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning PNS Management, in Article 162 of Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 which explains that the career development, competency development, career patterns, transfers, and promotions are civil servant career management which must be carried out by applying the principle of a merit system. The possibility to enhance capabilities, in this instance competency development for government officials, is one of the desired objectives and aspects of the merit system. Further arrangements regarding the development of civil servant competencies are regulated in the Republic of Indonesia State Administrative Institution Regulation Number 10 of 2018 concerning PNS Competency Development, hereinafter referred to as competency development, is an effort to fulfill the competency needs of PNS with Position competency standards and career development plans. In Article 203 Paragraph (3) and (4) Government Regulation No. 17 of 2020 concerning the Amendments to the Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 on the Management of Civil Servants, which explains that:

- 1) Every civil servant has the same rights and opportunities to be involved in competency development as referred to in Paragraph (1), taking into account the results of the performance appraisal and competency assessment of the civil servant concerned.
- 2) Competency development for each PNS as referred to in Paragraph (3) is carried out for at least 20 (twenty) hours of study in 1 (one) year.

Competency development can take place at the agency and national levels, ensuring that every civil servant has the same rights and opportunities while taking into consideration the results of the performance appraisal and competency assessment of the civil servant concerned. Civil employees' competency is highly beneficial for providing integrity as they provide public services to the community, so that services that are rapid, precise, accurate, and efficient may be accomplished.⁴

PNS Management, as described in Article 1 Point 1 Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 namely the management of civil servants, to produce professional civil servants, who have basic values, and professional ethics, free from political intervention, clean from corruption, collusion, and nepotism practices. The professionalism of civil servants, in this case, will create a socio-cultural competence. Socio-cultural competence as explained in Article 1 Number 15 of Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 are:

"Knowledge, skills, and attitudes/behavior that can be observed, measured, and developed related to the experience of interacting with a pluralistic society in terms of religion, ethnicity and culture, behavior, national insight, ethics, values, morals, emotions, and principles, which must be fulfilled by each position holder to obtain work results following the role, function and position"

Based on Article 176 Paragraph (1) of Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017, explains that civil servant career development is carried out based on qualifications, competence, performance appraisal, and the needs of government agencies. However, so far the implementation of PNS management has not been based on a comparison between the competencies and qualifications required by positions with the competencies and qualifications held by PNS. This can be seen from the data from the Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform (Kemen PANRB) which recorded 1.6 million people or 38 % of the total current civil servants only carry out simple jobs or can be called less useful or incompetent in their field.⁵

Therefore, the government must strive so they can increase the expertise of these civil servants through competency development. Therefore, in the future, they can be assigned to the fields that are needed by the world of bureaucracy today and can help carry out government tasks, development tasks, and public service tasks. The government as the recipient of authority in government duties also carries out human resource development. Education and training are also a systematic effort to develop

⁴ Edwyn Hari Prasetya, "Competence of State Civil Apparatus in Quality Improvement Public Service", *Jurist-Diction* 2, no. 6 (2019): 2019–81.

⁵ Cantika Adinda Putri, "Oh My Gosh! There Are 1.6 Million Civil Servants of the Republic of Indonesia Turn Out to Be Incompetent", 2022.

the apparatus competency in a variety of areas, including intellectual, managerial, and technical aspects. This is necessary to overcome various problems or shortcomings in the competence of the apparatus. Especially in government offices that deal directly with the interests of the community,

Civil servants must be competent to comply with the expectations of a government agency to support their performance. However, the reality is that not all civil servants who have met the requirements deserve their right to take part in the civil servant competency development, and that there are still many civil servants in West Sumatra Province who have not participated in the civil servant competency development, resulting in suboptimal efforts to develop the civil servant competencies.

This research aims to examine the management of civil servants in West Sumatra Province and the implementation of competency development for civil servants in West Sumatra Province.

The method of this research is empirical legal research using the statute, conceptual and sociolegal research. The empirical legal study examines how the law is applied in practice to individuals, groups, communities, and legal institutions in society with an emphasis on the conduct of individuals or communities, organizations, or legal institutions concerning the application or enactment of the law ⁶. This research is descriptive legal research in character, is explanatory, and aims to obtain a complete picture of the legal position in force in a particular place, or regarding the existing juridical phenomena, or certain legal events that occur in society.⁷

The data used in this research are collected from laws and regulations, books, official documents, publications, and research results. Furthermore, this research originates from field research which is a study conducted by collecting primary data and secondary data, as well as information obtained through direct interviews and asking for some information needed for research. After the primary data and secondary data are obtained, an analysis of these data will then be carried out using qualitative analysis methods, namely data analysis that does not use numbers but provides descriptions in words of findings and therefore prioritizes quality (quality) from data, and not quantity. ⁸

2. ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

2.1. Civil Servant Management in West Sumatra Province

The government needs state civil employees who are adept in bureaucratic processes and possess excellent digital literacy. Additionally, the government needs a civil servant who can maintain integrated and flexible working techniques while still providing

⁶ Muhaimin, *Legal Research Methods* (Mataram: Mataram University Press, 2020).

⁷ Abdulkadir Muhammad, *Law and Legal Research* (Bandung: Citra Aditya Bakti, 2004).

⁸ Muhammad.

responsive public services.⁹ Based on Article 1 Number 1 Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants, it is the management of civil servants to produce civil servants who are professional, have basic values, and professional ethics, are free from political intervention, clean from corruption, collusion, and nepotism practices. Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning PNS Management is also the main foundation of the ASN Law in PNS management which is based on a merit system in accordance with Article 51 of the ASN Law. Based on Article 1 point 22 of the ASN Law, it is explained that the merit system is the policy and management of ASN based on qualifications, competence, and performance fairly and reasonably, regardless of political background, race, skin color, religion, or origin. According to the bureaucracy of civil servants reform plan, the planning phase shouldn't be applied to all civil servants in Indonesia because regional differences in civil servant characteristics, such as performance, commitment, and even discipline, may exist. Due to these differences, the strategy as initially conceived is rendered obsolete.¹⁰

The merit system also has the objective of recruiting ASN with professionalism and integrity and placing them in government bureaucratic positions according to their competence, Maintaining ASN through fair and proper compensation, Developing ASN capabilities through guidance and training, Protecting ASN careers from politicization and policies which is contrary to the principle of merit. Furthermore, the merit system also has its indicators based on Article 134 Paragraph (2) Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning PNS Management. The work that a State Civil Servant completes in carrying out his duties under the work quality responsibilities delegated to him is referred to as his "work performance." The performance of State Civil Servants, whether good or bad, has a substantial influence on the quality and quantity of their job. State civil servants' performance as state civil servants would be compromised if their work is of poor quality. Satisfactory job performance may result in good overall performance.¹¹

In the context of improving apparatus management, it is explained in the Law on the State Civil Apparatus that personnel management is a complex system in the form of a business or efforts aimed at establishing and creating efficiency, effectiveness, and a degree of professionalism in the implementation of duties, functions, and obligations of the staff. The desired efficiency is, of course, the activities carried out really serve well instead of the existing regulations which are burdensome and make it difficult for the community to obtain the services. The expected effectiveness is of course the number of existing employees or civil servants who can provide maximum results and satisfy

9 Hary Wahyudi, 'The New Direction of Competency Development Policy for the State Civil Apparatus during the New Normal Era in Indonesia', *Italienisch*, 11.1 (2021), 110–20

10 Lily et al., "The Antecedent of Work Motivation and the Effect on the Performance of Civil Servants with Job Satisfaction as Moderating Variable (A Study of Civil Servants on West Coast, North Sumatra - Indonesia)," *International Journal of Economic Research* 14, no. 8 (2017): 161–76.

11 Elvita Sumarauw et al., "Performance of State Civil Apparatus at the Regional Human Resources Development Agency of Central Sulawesi Province," *EAI International Conference* 11, no. 12 (2022): 2–6, <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.11-10-2021.2319638>.

the community. Meanwhile, in the efforts to increase the degree of professionalism, it is clear how the government, with personnel management, expects that the employees or civil servants can have maximum capabilities in carrying out staffing duties, functions, and obligations. In the introduction to personnel management, it is explained that there are several activities or process scope of personnel management as explained in Article 2 of Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning PNS Management, which includes the preparation and the determination of needs, procurement, rank and position, career development, career patterns, promotions, transfers, performance appraisal, payroll and benefits, awards, discipline, dismissal, pension and old age security, and protection.

Management of Regional PNS in West Sumatra Province includes several aspects of the development of PNS competence which is part of the management of PNS career development. Career development for Civil Servants is carried out based on qualifications, competence (technical, managerial, and socio-cultural), performance appraisal, and the needs of Government Agencies, taking into account integrity and morality. In developing competence, Civil Servants are allowed to carry out work practices in other agencies at the central and regional levels, and exchanges between Civil Servants and private employees within a maximum period of 1 (one) year.

Low employee professionalism, a lack of a strong work ethic, and inconsistent application of employee discipline are all common issues that have plagued Indonesia's civil servants (ASN) from the country's early history to the present. This is especially true of ASN in the country's rural areas. As a result, the general public reflects doubts about how efficiently ASN performs. Implementing an accurate, responsible, and professional employee performance management system, as required by Government Regulations number 30/2019, is one of the initiatives. In Government Regulation Number 30/2019 concerning Performance Assessment of Civil Servants (ASN), ASN Performance Assessment aims to ensure the objectivity of ASN development based on the achievement system and career system.¹² In developing civil servant careers

12 Edy Jumady and L. Lilla, "Antecedent and Consequence the Human Resources Management Factors on Civil Servant Performance," *Golden Ratio of Human Resource Management* 1, no. 2 (2021): 104–16, <https://doi.org/10.52970/grhrm.v1i2.101>.work environment on performance. This type of research is explanatory research. The research sample is a civil servant at Pare-pare city, Indonesia; Data use purposive random sampling of 40 respondents. The research period was carried out in October - December 2020. The method of analysis in this study was multiple regression analysis. The results of this study indicate that work motivation and work environment have a significant effect on performance. This study proves that both theoretically and previous empirical studies explain that increasing motivation and work environment will improve civil servant performance. To get the best results, an employee needs to balance the ability to perform the task given and the willingness to complete the job. This balance can lead to an increase in productivity and an improvement in inefficiency. Motivated employees can lead to increased productivity and allow an organization to achieve higher levels of output. A healthy workplace environment: workplace culture, creating a happier corporate culture. Every company has its own corporate culture. Great company culture can keep employees productive and even help your company retain the best employees, and happy workers are also more likely to stick around"; "author": [{"dropping-particle": ""}, "family": "Jumady", "given": "Edy", "non-dropping-particle": ""}, "parse-names": false, "suffix": ""}, {"dropping-particle": ""}, "family": "Lilla", "given": "L.", "non-dropping-particle": ""}, "parse-names": false, "suffix": ""}], "container-title": "Golden Ratio of Human Resource Management", "id": "ITEM-1", "issue": "2", "issued": {"date-parts": [{"2021"}]}, "page": "104-116", "title": "Antecedent and Consequence the Human Resources Management Factors on Civil Servant Performance", "type": "article-journal", "volume": "1"}, "uris": [{"http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=c765b2e3-5cd2-414b-adda-5199a8c0a074"}, {"http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=f50430f4-ba53-4792-8057-15e7c3ad1102"}]}, "mendeley": {"formattedCitation": "Edy Jumady and L. Lilla, \"Antecedent and Consequence the Human Resources

and competencies, the West Sumatra provincial government carries out development activities for PNS functional positions which aim to manage PNS functional positions within the West Sumatra Provincial Government. This can be seen from the data of the Regional Civil Service Agency (BKD) of West Sumatra Province in 2021, the Functional Position SK issued a total of 1401 SK and 5 SK Main Level Functional Officials with a performance achievement rate of 162%. However, the implementation is insufficient since it is only intended for functional positions, other positions should be provided as well, so that competency development may occur equitably. Furthermore, the West Sumatra Provincial government is implementing an increase in the knowledge and skills of Civil Servants who will retire in the field of entrepreneurship. The activities were carried out by 30 people in 2017, 25 people in 2018, 25 people in 2019, 25 people in 2020, and 40 people in 2021.

According to the data above, the competency development of civil servants was only for those who were about to retire; the main thing that the government should focus on was the provision of competence for civil servants who were still productive because there were still many civil servants who were incompetent in handling their duties and functions in their field related to public services. Besides that, not all civil servants who are about to retire will receive this provision, this can be seen from the data on retired civil servants and civil servants who have been provided with supplies.

In addition to career development, the West Sumatra provincial government conducts Assessment Center Management Activities. This is done to find out the potential of Civil Servants so that their placement in one task area is in tandem with their competence so that the attainment of the established objectives is maximized. However, it is still found that the mapping, assessment, and development of civil servant competencies is still not optimal as a basis for competency development and civil servant careers, this is because the merit system has not been implemented optimally.

In the implementation of socialization and dissemination of information on civil servant functional positions, it was found that the staffing information system was still not optimal, especially in integrating all employee data, this was due to the lack of information technology HR knowledge for managing the staffing information systems.

From the explanation above, the problems that still exist in the management of civil servants in West Sumatra Province, especially in developing civil servant careers, is a need for improvement in the management of civil servants. Not to mention that to improve the quality of human resource management, the apparatus focuses more on the aspects of career development which are considered to be the core of the field of staffing.

2.2. Implementation of Competency Development for Civil Servants of West Suma-

tra Province

Employee performance is crucial to the success of the organization; poor employee performance will have a negative influence on organizational performance. Performance is influenced by a variety of elements, including leadership, job satisfaction, leadership ability, motivation, and training. Culture, education, and motivation at work are all elements that affect performance.¹³ The West Sumatra Provincial Government has the purpose of enhancing civil servant competency, specifically to increase the quality of healthy, knowledgeable, competent, and competitive human resources. This demonstrates the role and responsibilities of the local government in increasing the quality of public workers in the West Sumatra province. According to statistics from the BKD of West Sumatra Province, the total number of government servants in the Province of West Sumatra in 2022 is 18,614 individuals, with the highest level of education being S1 with 12,695 people and the lowest level of education being S3 with 24 people.

The success of one's learning concerning the environment might serve as a sign of competence. Although reflective practice with capable citizens is required to complement the work of civil employees, it is the responsibility of civil servants to serve the citizens. Competency in the context of public administration emphasizes one's capacity to carry out and finish work either under the ideal of excellence or as needed by the pertinent public administration, with the presumption that the demand is obvious.¹⁴ The development of civil servants' competence is a central issue today, in the new paradigm to realize the face of a bureaucracy that is increasingly adaptive to the changes and developments of the times as well as the dynamics of community needs as users of government services (customers).¹⁵ Civil servants as part of the state machinery, state servants and public servants are expected to have the competency and are encouraged through competency development for civil servants in providing professional and quality public services to the community. This has been regulated in Article 70 of the ASN Law which explains that every ASN employee has the right and opportunity for competency development, including through education and training, courses, seminars, and upgrading programs.

13 Edi Sugiono, Suryono Efendi, and Yani Afrina, "The Effect of Training, Competence and Compensation on the Performance of New Civil Servants with Organizational Culture as Intervening: Studies at the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Indonesia," *International Journal of Science and Society* 3, no. 1 (2021): 262–79, <https://doi.org/10.54783/ijssoc.v3i1.292>.including Indonesia. The Coronavirus pandemic question is not only about the virus, which makes the health of an individual decrease, but in several countries, including Indonesia, the existence of the coronavirus pandemic has put the health ministry's performance in the spotlight because the coronavirus pandemic is related to health. Many have speculated that the increasing coronavirus pandemic in Indonesia is due to the Ministry of Health's slow performance in preventing the Coronavirus pandemic. This research uses quantitative methods with a descriptive analysis approach. The questionnaire uses a closed questionnaire presented in a question or statement equipped with alternative responses/answers. This research's analysis method is the quantitative analysis method using Structural Equation Model (SEM)

14 Andika Putra Pratama et al., "Civil Servants' Competence in Indonesia: Suggestions for Future Research in the Context of Business," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 169, no. 14 (2015): 371–77, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.322>.

15 Adi Mulyono, 'policy analysis of competence development of civil servants through education', *AT-TURATS*, 16.2 (2022), 151–67 < <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24260/at-turats.v16i2.2403> > .giving rise to challenges in its implementation for Ministries, Institutions, Local Governments (K/L/D)

In developing competence, each government agency is required to prepare an annual competency development plan which is contained in the annual work plan of the respective agency's budget.

According to the findings of the research done in West Sumatra Province, there is still a shortage of competency and competency development activities for government workers, such as the implementation of inadequate education and training. To improve the quality of service in the field of education and training of apparatus, the province of West Sumatra is still faced with various complex problems. Therefore, the quality of carrying out their main tasks and functions in the field of competency development for civil servants is still not optimal. Apparatuses must be able to adapt in this era of bureaucratic reform by continuously developing competence to be qualified, high achieving, and professional in carrying out the role of state administrator. Government agencies must take this action immediately to address strategic environmental demands, such as those brought on by the advancement of ICT, globalization, and increased competitiveness of the country, as well as rising community expectations for the performance of the national and regional governments in line with societal changes and dynamics.¹⁶

Based on research conducted in West Sumatra Province, the number of civil servants who have participated in competency development in the last 3 years is 1,168 people out of 18,614 civil servants in the West Sumatra Province government. From the data obtained, less than 7% of civil servants in the province of West Sumatra participated in competency development, even though there are still many civil servants who need competency development, but not all civil servants are provided. This proves that not all civil servants get the right and opportunity to develop their competence.

The results of the study show that the competency development of civil servants in West Sumatra Province is still not in line with Article 70 of the ASN Law and

16 Rati Sumanti, 'Developing The Competence Of Civil Servants: Challenges And Opportunities', *Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi*, 08.02 (2018), 115–129. every civil servant must have adequate competence in managerial, socio-cultural and technical competence. Government agencies both central and regional are required to develop civil servant's competencies that aim to develop the quality of knowledge, skills and behavior of civil servants so that they can perform the task well. This research aims to understand the development competence of civil servants in the local government. The result of research using qualitative approach with secondary data collection technique through literature study, obtained some challenges and opportunities faced by local government institution in doing civil servant development. The law about Aparatur Sipil Negara requires government agencies to fulfill the right of civil servants to get competence development from a minimum of twenty hours per year. To implement it, there are some challenges faced namely the gap between the competency standard of an office and the competence of the employee. In addition, there is no document of competency development plan in each agency and limited budget allocation in the local government to finance the planned competency development activities. As an effort to overcome these challenges, it needs creativity and innovation as an opportunity from government institution to fulfill the right of civil servant's competency development.", "author": [{"dropping-particle": "", "family": "Sumanti", "given": "Rati", "non-dropping-particle": "", "parse-names": false, "suffix": ""}], "container-title": "Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi", "id": "ITEM-1", "issue": "02", "issued": {"date-parts": [{"2018"}]}, "page": "115–129", "title": "DEVELOPING THE COMPETENCE OF CIVIL SERVANTS: CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES", "type": "article-journal", "volume": "08"}, "uris": [{"http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuiid=d771d343-47e4-4c02-9385-69e0c9a8f28f", "http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuiid=92f3932c-4499-43c2-b15d-81a707a035cc"}]}, "mendeley": {"formattedCitation": "Rati Sumanti, \"DEVELOPING THE COMPETENCE OF CIVIL SERVANTS: CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES,\" <i>Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi</i> 08, no. 02 (2018)"}

Article 203 of Government Regulation No. 17 of 2020 and Article 205 Paragraph (3) Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning PNS Management. We know that the implementation of PNS competency development seeks to increase the knowledge and abilities of the PNS in carrying out their tasks and responsibilities. However, According to the research findings, only 1,168 out of 18,614 civil servants in West Sumatra Province participated in competency development. This demonstrates that the development of PNS competencies in West Sumatra Province is still insufficient.

Development competence Apparatus State Civil is a must because has regulated at the statutory level until the rules below. Constitution Number 5 of 2014 concerning Apparatus State Civil in article 69 number 1 states that “ every ASN has rights and opportunities for develop competence”. Development competence is conducted through education and training, seminars, courses, workshops, upgrading, and others.¹⁷ In implementing education and training for civil servant competency development, the West Sumatra provincial government is assisted by the West Sumatra Provincial Human Resources Development Agency (BPSDM), this is based on West Sumatra Governor Regulation Number 79 of 2016 concerning Position, Structure, Organization and Functions and Work Procedures of The Regional Agency explaining that the BPSDM of West Sumatra Province is positioned as a supporting element for implementing the regional government tasks in the field of human resource development, which is under and responsible of the Governor through the Regional Secretary of West Sumatra Province. Furthermore, based on Regional Regulation Number 8 of 2016 concerning the Establishment of Regional Apparatuses of West Sumatra Province,

BPSDM of West Sumatra Province as the executor of civil servant education and training within the scope of the West Sumatra provincial government has carried out the development of civil servant competencies intended for civil servants in West Sumatra Province. However, from the data obtained in the last 3 years, civil servants who attended education and training carried out by BPSDM West Sumatra Province, namely only 914 people out of 18,614 civil servants in West Sumatra province, this shows that less than 5 % of Civil servants in West Sumatra Province who attended education and training,

¹⁷ Budur Latief, ‘Strategy for competence development of civil servants in the agency of human resources development ministry of internal affairs (a competency-based strategic study of human resources)’, *European Journal of Humanities and Educational Advancements (EJHEA)*, 3.08 (2022), 53–64.K/L and Local Government. The implementation of this regulation has not been fulfilled because the current competency development policy has not been based on an analysis of education and training needs. The purpose of this research is to map and collect the required competencies. It ‘s relevant in the implementation of the duties and functions of the BPSDM of Ministry of Home Affairs. This research is descriptive with a qualitative approach. Based on the results of the study, it can be concluded that the competencies needed in carrying out the main tasks and functions are core competencies and specific competencies of 15 job clumps and 67 competencies. These competencies apply to all positions. The Problems in developing ASN competencies at the BPSDM of Ministry of Home Affairs is learning facilities that are not standardized. It is not based on needs. The competency development has not been planned. The coordination has not been maximized. It needs adjusted to changes in development competence and competency development strategies on an ongoing basis have an impact on improving organizational performance. Refer to the Head of LAN Regulation Number 10 of 2018 concerning Competence Development of Civil Servants with a technology-based competency development pattern and non-classical competency development system that will be able to fulfill the fulfillment of competency development rights ASN Human Resources Development Agency 20 hours of lessons (JP

even though there are still many civil servants who need education and training, not all civil servants are provided. This proves that not all civil servants get the right and opportunity to develop their competence in the field of education and training.

Knowledge exchange may boost efficiency and generate a beneficial impact. However, for knowledge sharing to perform following corporate goals, high-quality human resources are required for implementation. Organizations must provide instruction, and training affects information interchange. It also improves human capital by establishing knowledge-sharing networks. The government should be able to monitor public personnel's information to keep them up to date on developments.¹⁸ The findings of this study suggest that the growth of PNS competence in West Sumatra Province remains far behind expectations, and the implementation of PNS competency development in West Sumatra Province is inadequate. Apart from that, the implementation of civil servant competency development in the province of West Sumatra is still suboptimal due to a variety of issues.

Based on the data from BKD of West Sumatra Province, the implementation of competency development for civil servants in West Sumatra has not been optimal because competency development has not been based on planning or the absence of a Human Capital Development Plan (HCDP) document. According to Article 1 Number 13 of LAN Regulation No. 10 of 2018 concerning Competency Development for Civil Servants, a competency development plan or HCDP is an agency-level competency development planning document determined by the staffing supervisor for the next 1 fiscal year.

The absence of HCDP is because there are no parties who can make this competency development plan / HCDP document. After all, in its manufacture several complete and structured stages are required, starting from inventory, verification, and validation as described in Article 7 of LAN Regulation No. 10 of 2018 Concerning Civil Servants Competency Development. Meanwhile, completing the stages of document creation requires comprehensive and clear data. However, to complete this, the province of West Sumatra is experiencing problems, namely the staffing information system is still not optimal, especially in integrating all employee data, the ASN performance appraisal system is not very accurate, plus not yet optimal mapping, assessment, and development of ASN competencies as a basis for developing the ASN competencies and careers. This clearly proves that in planning for the development of civil servant competencies, the West Sumatra Provincial Government is facing obstacles, of course, this will also have an impact on the implementation of competency development later. Even though the existence of HCDP provides an illustration of the agency's commitment to positioning human resources as strategic capital for agency development in building performance

18 Hasmin Tamsah et al., "Training, Knowledge Sharing, and Quality of Work-Life on Civil Servants Performance in Indonesia," *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies* 7, no. 3 (2020): 163–76, <https://doi.org/10.29333/ejecs/514>.

and creating added value under institutional mandates, as well as producing systemic, integrated, and sustainable management of human resources.

Reforms in the field of human resource management and civil service administration point to the changing role of public administration. This new role has been shaped by three main models: (a) public administration, (b) public management, and (c) governance.¹⁹ However, the implementation of integrated human resource management practices must be supported by effective policy measures, followed by a commitment from the planning and implementation cycles, supported by adequate resources. This is the foundation for the implementation of PNS Management, as mandated in Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, as well as Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning PNS Management.

Civil servants (PNS) play an important role in state and government administration. The mindset, motivation, passion, and discipline of the elements of the State Apparatus are fundamental to the smooth application of national development. Given the significance of a Civil Servant's role in national development, it is essential to provide assurances for the preservation, maintenance, and enhancement of welfare, hence enhancing work productivity.²⁰ In the implementation of civil servant competency development in West Sumatra Province, not all civil servants were able to take part in civil servant competency development, this was due to constraints on budget availability, especially during the past 3 years of the Covid-19 outbreak which resulted in the budget for employee competency development in West Sumatra Province decreased, because the employee competency development budget was cut or diverted to other priority activities to tackle the Covid-19 outbreak.

Based on the data obtained from the West Sumatra Provincial Civil Service Agency, the budget for implementing the civil servant competency development for the last 3 years at the West Sumatra Province Regional Personnel Agency has decreased significantly, especially in 2021 the budget is very much different from 2020. We know

19 Priyono Tjiptoherijanto, "Civil Service Reform in Indonesia' In Comparative Governance Reform in Asia: Democracy, Corruption, and Government Trust.," *Emerald Insight* 17 (2008): 39–53, [https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0732-1317\(08\)17004-X](https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0732-1317(08)17004-X).

20 Desvira Utami Rahmadini and Muhammad Arif, "Effectiveness of Civil Servant Retirement Payment Services at PT. Pos Indonesia KCP Perbaungan," *Jurnal Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Akuntansi Review* 2, no. 1 (2022): 201–6, <https://doi.org/10.53697/emba.v2i1.545>. and the technique of collecting data is observation or direct observation to the research location, conducting interviews, and documentation. The results showed that the service provided by PT. Pos Indonesia Kcp Perbaungan is good but not effective enough. This is because there are several components that are still lacking but are not the most important, such as the absence of queue numbers and office equipment which sometimes experience machine problems. With this research, it is hoped that the company will be able to meet the existing deficiencies in order to achieve effectiveness in service.,"author":{"dropping-particle":"","family":"Rahmadini","given":"Desvira Utami","non-dropping-particle":"","parse-names":false,"suffix":""},"dropping-particle":"","family":"Arif","given":"Muhammad","non-dropping-particle":"","parse-names":false,"suffix":""},"container-title":"Jurnal Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis dan Akuntansi Review","id":"ITEM-1","issue":"1","issued":{"date-parts":[["2022"]]},"page":"201-206","title":"Effectiveness of Civil Servant Retirement Payment Services at PT. Pos Indonesia KCP Perbaungan","type":"article-journal","volume":"2"},"uris":["http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=b2d03945-155b-463a-83e4-5ff6a2c3680e","http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=7c-be6014-7912-4dc8-baa4-73e08b0956c5"]},"mendeley":{"formattedCitation":"Desvira Utami Rahmadini and Muhammad Arif, \"Effectiveness of Civil Servant Retirement Payment Services at PT. Pos Indonesia KCP Perbaungan,\" <i>Jurnal Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Akuntansi Review</i> 2, no. 1 (2022)"}</p>
</div>
<div data-bbox="129 931 537 950" data-label="Page-Footer">
188 Jurnal IUS Kajian Hukum dan Keadilan
</div>

that a development program does demand a significant amount of money, especially the competency development of civil servants carried out outside the Province due to the high cost of transportation and accommodation. This can be observed in the development of PNS competencies that have been carried out, namely the development of PNS competencies carried out inside the province and outside the province, where there is a significant cost difference, with the cost of producing PNS competencies outside the province being significantly higher. Due to this budget limitation, not all civil servants can participate in competency development, which results in competency development in the regions not being fully implemented. Therefore, the availability of a budget is an important thing as one of the factors that can support the achievement of good civil servant competency development.

In addition to funding constraints, there is also one component that remains unaddressed, namely the restricted availability of educational and training facilities that do not yet satisfy the criteria of State Administration Institutions. This is the cause of the development of civil servant competencies in West Sumatra Province not following the current trend of developing employee competencies, especially in terms of education and training infrastructure, because the human resources of civil servants, both from Widyaaiswara staff (Educators / Training Trainers) and participants who take part in Training, are still limited in implementing information and communication technology (ICT) in education and training management as well as for direct training activities. Meanwhile, the organization's present demands need the formation of competent and professional civil employees through education and training, both technical, functional, and structural.

According to Griffin, the competency development of civil servants is based on the fact that civil servants need a series of knowledge, skills, and abilities that develop to be able to carry out their duties and functions properly.²¹ In carrying out competency development in West Sumatra Province, especially at the district/city level, there are still obstacles in its implementation evidenced by data obtained from one of the districts/cities, namely West Pasaman Regency which explains that the development of civil servant competencies in the district is experiencing problems because it has not special

21 Rahmadini and Arif. and the technique of collecting data is observation or direct observation to the research location, conducting interviews, and documentation. The results showed that the service provided by PT. Pos Indonesia Kcp Perbaungan is good but not effective enough. This is because there are several components that are still lacking but are not the most important, such as the absence of queue numbers and office equipment which sometimes experience machine problems. With this research, it is hoped that the company will be able to meet the existing deficiencies in order to achieve effectiveness in service.”, “author”: [“dropping-particle”: “”, “family”: “Rahmadini”, “given”: “Desvira Utami”, “non-dropping-particle”: “”, “parse-names”: false, “suffix”: “”], [“dropping-particle”: “”, “family”: “Arif”, “given”: “Muhammad”, “non-dropping-particle”: “”, “parse-names”: false, “suffix”: “”], “container-title”: “Jurnal Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis dan Akuntansi Review”, “id”: “ITEM-1”, “issue”: “1”, “issued”: {“date-parts”: [[“2022”]]}, “page”: “201-206”, “title”: “Effectiveness of Civil Servant Retirement Payment Services at PT. Pos Indonesia KCP Perbaungan”, “type”: “article-journal”, “volume”: “2”, “uris”: [“http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=7cbe6014-7912-4dcb-baa4-73e08b0956c5”]], “mendeley”: {“formattedCitation”: “Rahmadini and Arif.”, “plainTextFormattedCitation”: “Rahmadini and Arif.”, “previouslyFormattedCitation”: “Rahmadini and Arif.”}, “properties”: {“noteIndex”: 21}, “schema”: “https://github.com/citation-style-language/schema/raw/master/csl-citation.json”}

arrangements/Perda/Perkada related to the competency development of civil servants in West Pasaman Regency. And there is also no classification/ categorization of the employees who are entitled to participate in competency development, so until now there is no accurate data regarding the employees who have got the competence development programs. The development of Human Resources of state civil apparatus becomes the authority of the Region and the assistance task which is assigned to the Region.²²

From this obstacle, the government should form a legal basis regarding the competency development methods for the regional civil servants and also conduct an analysis of employee competencies, as well as carry out planning and development of civil servant competencies at the West Pasaman Regency level, because West Pasaman Regency has 4675 civil servants or 25 % of civil servants of the West Sumatra Province. For this reason, the government's attention is needed, so that the rights of civil servants are fulfilled in terms of developing their competency. Furthermore, in carrying out the education and training needs in West Sumatra Province, especially at the district/city level, there are still limitations in carrying out their education and training, the limitations of the district/city in organizing this education and training are due to the limited authority to organize training and limited services for types of training, especially technical training and functional in the district/city.

District/city constraints in offering various forms of education and training services are a challenge for BPSDM West Sumatra Province as the organizer of training in West Sumatra province to develop the education and training that is implemented. In addition to the limitations on the types of education and training, districts and cities

22 Erni Irawati et al., "Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates in Improving Public Services in Central Java," *International Journal of Social Science* 1, no. 3 (2021): 209–24, <https://doi.org/10.53625/ijss.v1i3.414>.as the main engine for running the government. Furthermore, the development of Human Resources of state civil apparatus becomes the authority of the Region and the assistance task which is assigned to the Region. In this study, four aspects related to the evaluation of the effectiveness of basic training for civil servant candidates were seen; which are as follows, Integrated Competence Development, State Defense Attitudes and Behaviors, Actualization of the Basic Values of Civil Servants, and the Position and Role of Civil Servants in the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia. Competence is needed in service functions. Therefore, civil servants need to be equipped with practical education, not just theoretical. Basic Training for the Prospective Civil Servant as the initial provision for Prospective Civil Servants is a strategic training in which there are dominant aspects contained in the learning curriculum to be actualized later in the work and duties of the participants who are functions as civil servants. Curriculum development and learning systems that emphasize the transfer of culture or how those values will be integrated in the attitudes and behavior of the apparatus, become a culture, work ethic that supports the professionalism of their duties and positions. Analysis of the effectiveness of the results of the training on the competence of the training alumni is to conduct an assessment of the achievement of objectives, and the standard competence that have been set. In this case, the standard competence which is used is based on the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 38 of 2017 which is concerning about Competency Standards for State Civil Apparatus Positions,"author":{"dropping - particle":"","family":"Erni Irawati","given":"","non-dropping-particle":"","parse-names":false,"suffix":""},"dropping-particle":"","family":"Endang Larasati","given":"","non-dropping-particle":"","parse-names":false,"suffix":""},"dropping-particle":"","family":"Hardi Warsono","given":"","non-dropping-particle":"","parse-names":false,"suffix":""},"dropping-particle":"","family":"Ida Hayu Dwimawanti","given":"","non-dropping-particle":"","parse-names":false,"suffix":""},"container-title":"International Journal of Social Science","id":"ITEM-1","issue":"3","issued":{"date-parts":["2021"]},"page":"209-224","title":"Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates in Improving Public Services in Central Java","type":"article-journal","volume":"1"},"uris":["http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=d-695cb23-5b20-4c6f-9a3f-dde33f6acaa2","http://www.mendeley.com/documents/?uuid=8c203ed6-c935-47e5-bd47-be00611d8853"]},"mendeley":{"formattedCitation":"Erni Irawati et al., \"Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates in Improving Public Services in Central Java,\" <i>International Journal of Social Science </i> 1, no. 3 (2021)

have limited authority in administering pre-service training, structural leadership levels III and IV. Meanwhile, districts/cities really need the facilitation of Pre-service Education and Training, Level III and IV Leadership to meet their organizational needs. This is a challenge for BPSDM of West Sumatra Province to improve the Pre-service Education and Training services as well as Level III and Level IV Leadership so that the implementation of education and training at the district/city level can be optimally fulfilled. Furthermore, the limited use of information and communication technology (ICT) in organizing the training in districts and cities is also a challenge for the BPSDM of West Sumatra Province to develop education and training services. Even though the BPSDM of West Sumatra Province already has a Training Management Information System (SIM) application, it is still not optimized for online services to facilitate education and training management and to improve the services with an E-office-based service system.

The limitations of districts/cities in implementing education and training, this has resulted in virtually no quality assurance for education and training in all districts and cities, even in several other government education and training institutions in West Sumatra. In reality, in the current period of bureaucratic reform, the demand for quality education and training cannot be disputed since it is supported by societal expectations for the quality of professional apparatus resources. Therefore, civil servants at the district/city government and vertical agencies in West Sumatra, need to develop their competencies, and only the BPSDM of West Sumatra Province is competent to carry out human resource development because it is the only education and training institution accredited by the State Administration Agency.

Some of the problems faced by the regional government of West Sumatra province in developing the competence of civil servants are caused by 2 main problems. **First**, the mandate of Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning ASN has not been fulfilled, Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 and Number 17 of 2021 concerning PNS Management states that every civil servant has the same rights and opportunities to be involved in competency development at least 20 JP/year. This can be seen from the fact that there are still many Echelon II, III, and IV officials who have not attended the leadership training according to their position level, such as Reform Leader Academy (RLA), Administrator Leadership Training (PKA) and Supervisory Leadership Training (PKP). The Government Competency Certification for ASN in the Government of West Sumatra Province has not been maximized. There is no clear regulation between ASN career paths and educational and training requirements that must be followed so ASN interest is still low in participating in competency development. The Information Technology (IT) system has not been maximized to increase the training. Furthermore, this problem is caused by the limited authority to organize training regulations and requirements, the low interest of officials to take part in training, the limited application of information

and communication technology (ICT) in education and training management as well as for directing the training activities, there are demands for education and training reforms which require the need to improve the quality of staff systematic and sustainable training, so that the ASN's interest is still low to participate in competency development.

Second, Permen PAN and RB Number 25 of 2021 concerning Simplification of Organizational Structures in Government Agencies for Simplification of Bureaucracy, which regulates the equalization of administrative positions into functional positions. For this reason, simplification of the bureaucracy, with the discourse of equalizing administrative positions into functional positions, is deemed necessary to prepare and develop HR Development plans for the Functional Positions and it is necessary to formulate the types of education and training required for new functional positions. However, this could not be implemented due to the unavailability of a database regarding the types of training required for all functional positions.

Based on the discussion above, efforts must be made to overcome the problems in developing PNS competencies in West Sumatra Province, so that the PNS competency development can run optimally. It is necessary to develop a competency development plan or Human Capital Development Plan (HCDP) in the West Sumatra provincial government by involving various parties, both internal government and external government parties, so that a good HCDP document is compiled and can be used for the implementation of civil servant competency development in West Sumatra Province.

Then, providing equal opportunity to all existing civil servants to attend the training, especially for those who have never attended the education and training programs. This can be done by conducting internal training within agencies or the internal government of West Sumatra Province itself. Besides this internal training can reach all existing civil servants and it can also be a cheaper alternative in its implementation because it is not implemented outside the province. And civil servants can also carry out competency development independently at personal expense, and can also carry out online civil servant competency development such as participating in virtual education and training or attending webinars, so this can be a solution that can be used in current conditions.

Furthermore, it is necessary to evaluate the competency development at the provincial level which is carried out through an assessment mechanism for the suitability between the competency development plan and the implementation of competency development, and the benefits of implementing competency development for competency improvement and employee performance improvement. And this also requires the participation of all West Sumatra government agencies to improve and report on the PNS database in terms of developing PNS competencies, so that the data can be processed and used as a reference in improving the competency development of PNS in West Sumatra Province later.

3. CONCLUSIONS

So far, the management of civil servants in West Sumatra Province has not been based on a comparison between the competencies and qualifications required by positions with the competencies and qualifications held by the civil servants. As well as the not-yet optimal implementation of the merit system in the management of PNS in West Sumatra Province, this can be seen from the planning stages, procuring needs for the development of PNS competencies which have not yet been carried out with an analysis based on the needs for position formation and competency standards, even though to be able to provide personnel resources the right position in carrying out the tasks to be carried out, requires a basis for a study of job analysis and workload analysis which will become the basis for analyzing the management of civil servants. The non-optimal management of civil servants has an impact on the competence of less effective employees so that the implementation of their duties often does not run optimally and affects public services. Therefore, the Province of West Sumatra must reorganize the human resources of the apparatus based on the management of civil servants with the principle of a merit system, as well as governance by taking into account conformity with the objectives, urgency, vision, and mission of the Province of West Sumatra.

According to the data obtained, only 1,168 out of 18,614 civil servants in West Sumatra Province participated in PNS competency development, and the annual competency development plan document was not prepared, indicating that it is still not optimal and the implementation is not yet appropriate. Civil servant competencies are developed in accordance with applicable rules, including Article 70 of the ASN Law and Article 203 of Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017. As well in implementing civil servant competency development, West Sumatra Province faces several obstacles such as the absence of a competency development plan document or Human Capital Development Plan (HCDP), limited budget availability, In addition, the Province of West Sumatra has not followed the trend in the development of current employee competencies, especially in terms of education and training facilities and apparatus resources. This obstacle is because the implementation of the PNS competency development has not been based on PNS management based on a merit system. After all, we know this merit system is a principle in PNS management, especially in developing the PNS competencies.

REFERENCES

- Erni Irawati, Endang Larasati, Hardi Warsono, and Ida Hayu Dwimawanti. "Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Basic Training for Civil Servant Candidates in Improving Public Services in Central Java." *International Journal of Social Science* 1, no. 3 (2021): 209–24. <https://doi.org/10.53625/ijss.v1i3.414>.
- Jumady, Edy, and L. Lilla. "Antecedent and Consequence the Human Resources Management Factors on Civil Servant Performance." *Golden Ratio of Human*

- Resource Management* 1, no. 2 (2021): 104–16. <https://doi.org/10.52970/grhrm.v1i2.101>.
- Latief, Budur. “STRATEGY FOR COMPETENCE DEVELOPMENT OF CIVIL SERVANTS IN THE AGENCY OF HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT MINISTRY OF INTERNAL AFFAIRS (A COMPETENCY-BASED STRATEGIC STUDY OF HUMAN RESOURCES).” *European Journal of Humanities and Educational Advancements (EJHEA)* 3, no. 08 (2022): 53–64.
- Lily, Paham Ginting, Prihatin Lumbanraja, and Elisabet Siahaan. “The Antecedent of Work Motivation and the Effect on the Performance of Civil Servants with Job Satisfaction as Moderating Variable (A Study of Civil Servants on West Coast, North Sumatra - Indonesia).” *International Journal of Economic Research* 14, no. 8 (2017): 161–76.
- Muhaimin. *Legal Research Methods*. Mataram: Mataram University Press, 2020.
- Muhammad, Abdulkadir. *Law and Legal Research*. Bandung: Citra Aditya Bakti, 2004.
- Mulyono, Adi. “POLICY ANALYSIS OF COMPETENCE DEVELOPMENT OF CIVIL SERVANTS THROUGH EDUCATION.” *AT-TURATS* 16, no. 2 (2022): 151–67. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24260/at-turats.v16i2.2403>.
- Mutiarin, Dyah. “Improving Indonesia Civil Servants Performance.” *Jurnal Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta* 3, no. 2 (2012): 1–21.
- Prasetia, Edwyn Hari. “Competence of State Civil Apparatus in Quality Improvement Public Service.” *Jurist-Diction* 2, no. 6 (2019): 2019–81.
- Pratama, Andika Putra, Achmad Ghazali, Nur Arief R. Putranto, Ken Ratri Iswari, Anggara Wisesa, and Hary Febriansyah. “Civil Servants’ Competence in Indonesia: Suggestions for Future Research in the Context of Business.” *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 169, no. 14 (2015): 371–77. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.322>.
- Prijono Tjiptoherijanto. “‘Civil Service Reform in Indonesia’ In Comparative Governance Reform in Asia: Democracy, Corruption, and Government Trust.” *Emerald Insight* 17 (2008): 39–53. [https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0732-1317\(08\)17004-X](https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0732-1317(08)17004-X).
- Putri, Cantika Adinda. “Oh My Gosh! There Are 1.6 Million Civil Servants of the Republic of Indonesia Turn Out to Be Incompetent”, 2022.
- Rahmadini, Desvira Utami, and Muhammad Arif. “Effectiveness of Civil Servant Retirement Payment Services at PT. Pos Indonesia KCP Perbaungan.” *Jurnal Ekonomi, Manajemen, Bisnis Dan Akuntansi Review* 2, no. 1 (2022): 201–6. <https://doi.org/10.53697/emba.v2i1.545>.
- Sri Hartini, et al. *Civil Service Law in Indonesia*. Jakarta: Sinar Graphic, 2011.
- Sugiono, Edi, Suryono Efendi, and Yani Afrina. “The Effect of Training, Competence and Compensation on the Peformance of New Civil Servants with Organizational Culture as Intervening: Studies at the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Indonesia.” *International Journal of Science and Society* 3, no. 1 (2021): 262–79. <https://doi.org/10.54783/ijsoc.v3i1.292>.

- Sumanti, Rati. "DEVELOPING THE COMPETENCE OF CIVIL SERVANTS: CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES." *Jurnal Transformasi Administrasi* 08, no. 02 (2018): 115–129.
- Sumarauw, Elvita, Daswati Daswati, Rachmad Rachmad, and Haryati Haryati. "Performance of State Civil Apparatus at the Regional Human Resources Development Agency of Central Sulawesi Province." *EAI International Conference* 11, no. 12 (2022): 2–6. <https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.11-10-2021.2319638>.
- Tamsah, Hasmin, Ansar, Gunawan, Yusriadi Yusriadi, and Umi Farida. "Training, Knowledge Sharing, and Quality of Work-Life on Civil Servants Performance in Indonesia." *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Studies* 7, no. 3 (2020): 163–76. <https://doi.org/10.29333/ejecs/514>.
- Wahyudi, Hary. "The New Direction of Competency Development Policy for the State Civil Apparatus during the New Normal Era in Indonesia." *Italienisch* 11, no. 1 (2021): 110–20.